GOAL

01

Cultivate Justice

Increase health, wealth, leadership, and power for BIPOC communities across our food system
Introduction

In our food system, healthy food access, food and farm labor, and land and business ownership are all divided along racial and ethnic lines. Black, Indigenous, and people of color (BIPOC) experience the highest rates of poverty, food insecurity, and diet-related illness.

Food and farm workers—many of whom are people of color—generally receive low wages, have few labor protections, and work under compromised conditions on a regular basis. BIPOC communities also experience significant disparities in farm, business, and land ownership, dramatically limiting opportunities for community wealth building, power, and leadership.

Justice and Our Food System

The food system is not broken. It functions precisely according to design, generating profit for the few rather than providing nourishment, viability, and justice for all.

In our research, every dataset, analysis, and report with demographic information—supported by interviews and survey results—points to racial, ethnic, gender, economic, and other inequities across the food system in the following areas:

Access to Land and Land Tenure

BIPOC, socially disadvantaged, young, and beginning farmers experience significant disparities finding and affording quality farmland and securing land tenure, dramatically limiting opportunities for community wealth building, power, and leadership. For example, Black Americans make up 12.3% of the U.S. population but only 1.4% of farmers on 0.5% of land in agriculture. The number of Black farmers is estimated to have peaked in the 1910s. Black farmers only received 0.1% ($20.8 million) of $26 billion allocated via the Coronavirus Food Assistance Program. In response, there is growing awareness and energy behind the movement from disparity to parity for BIPOC and socially disadvantaged producers. In 2017, the state of California passed the Farmer Equity Act since “California’s farmers and ranchers are made up of a diverse group of people, and not all have historically had access to resources and information in order to successfully run their businesses.” Recommendations from the Farmer Equity Act include greater education and outreach, materials translated into multiple languages, greater BIPOC representation on boards, and grant funding support.

Farm, Fishery, and Food Business Viability

“Achieving profitability/making a living” was the top challenge cited by farms, fisheries, and food businesses through Food Vision 2030 interviews and surveys. Overcoming this challenge requires addressing a daunting mix of everyday issues like navigating permits, finding workers, and accessing markets that are intertwined with an increasingly concentrated marketplace that makes it difficult to compete and achieve profitability. The majority of San Diego County farms, fisheries, and food businesses are small or midsize in terms of scale, sales, or employment. For example, 84.7% of farms in San Diego County had sales of less than $50,000 in 2017 and these farms generated only 4.3% of total sales. Farms with sales above $500,000 accounted for 4.8% of farms but 86.5% of sales. In other words, the largest farms account for the overwhelming majority of sales while smaller farms have access to only a small fraction of the sales. Nationally, USDA maps show that small farms with low sales are disproportionately concentrated in regions with Indigenous, Black, and Hispanic/Latinx producers.

* Mai Nguyen and Martin Lemos, April 2019, California Young Farmers Report 2019, National Young Farmers Coalition
* “Quantum Leap Toward Justice” Mitter Jones
* California Department of Food & Agriculture, 2020, 2020 Report to the California Legislature on the Farmer Equity Act
* Market concentration refers to vertical, horizontal, and backward integration. Vertical integration refers to a company owning the various elements of its supply chain (e.g., when Target has its own brands and manufacturing facilities). Horizontal integration refers to a company owning and offering products at the same place on the value chain (e.g., when Hartz and Kraft Foods merged and offered many of the same types of products). Backward integration refers to a company owning a major supplier or distributor (e.g., when Coca-Cola invests in poultry production and processing).
INTRODUCTION

Health Outcomes

Public health research documents disparities in diet quality by race/ethnicity, education level, income, and use of food assistance programs in the United States. Differences in diet quality contribute to disparities in cardiovascular disease (the leading cause of death), obesity, Type II diabetes, and other diet-related problems among BIPOC and low income Americans. For example, in San Diego County, Indigenous (52.71%) and Black (50.14%) San Diegans have the highest rates of death from Type II diabetes. Body mass index trends in San Diego County also show disparities: About 54% of Indigenous adults are obese, 36% of Blacks, 33% of Hispanic/Latinx, 23% of Whites, and 20% of Asians. The California Healthy Places Index aggregates many community indicators—including exposure to air pollution and access to health care—to paint a picture of disparities stretching from the City of San Diego down to the border, as well as rural areas.

Food Insecurity

About 26 million Americans are food insecure today. The San Diego Hunger Coalition estimates that about 616,000 San Diegans were food insecure prior to the pandemic. That number nearly doubled, to 1,230,000 San Diegans in May 2020, and was down to a little more than 1 million in August 2020. Food insecurity is concentrated in low income and BIPOC communities, including in southeastern neighborhoods in the City of San Diego, an area that was redlined nearly 90 years ago.

Access to Healthy Food

Access to healthy food varies by zip code—BIPOC and other historically marginalized neighborhoods experience disproportionately poor access to essential goods and services, including food. In particular, San Diego County’s 18 Indigenous reservations have very limited access to grocery stores and restaurants, and several neighborhoods in southeastern neighborhoods of the City of San Diego are characterized as “low income, low access.”

Wages and Career Opportunities

Most food system workers are employed in food services (i.e., restaurants, fast food, stores) or agricultural labor, are BIPOC women, receive extraordinarily low wages (Figures 1 and 2), have few labor protections, and work under challenging circumstances on a regular basis. Analyzing wage gaps by race and ethnicity shows that BIPOC San Diegans are much more likely than White San Diegans to work in low-wage occupations, including many food system jobs (Figure 1). SDWP research reveals that 8% of variation in median wages across occupations in San Diego County can be attributed solely to the portion of White workers of the particular occupation. That figure grows to 29% when we look only at food system occupations (Figure 2, on following page). In other words: Food system occupations have higher percentages of segregation.


Leadership Opportunities

The “Whiteness” of the local food movement has limited its ability to address structural racism and center BIPOC leaders in the food system. A history of racist and discriminatory policies and practices in America have created systemic barriers to leadership. For example, our review of 29 San Diego County food system organizations that have boards of directors found that just 6 organizations have boards that are at least 50% BIPOC. Coined “philanthropic redlining,” research has shown that organizations led by people of color are also awarded less grant money and are trusted less to make decisions about how to spend those funds than groups with White leaders.13

Vulnerability to Risks

At the time of publication, over 3.5 million people, including over 600,000 Americans, 63,000 Californians, and over 3,700 San Diegans have died from the COVID-19 pandemic. BIPOC communities and food system workers in San Diego County have been disproportionately impacted in terms of exposure, unemployment, and deaths.

American Society, Our Economy, and Our Food Systems Were Built on Entrenched Discrimination

American society, our economy, and our food systems were built from the genocide of Indigenous people14 and the enslavement of African people.18 Policies pursued by federal, state, and county governments, including the Indian Removal Act (1830), Dawes Act (1887), Urban Relocation Program (1956) and many other instances of forced removal, violence, broken treaties, and discrimination played a role in the dismantling of unique Indigenous societies—and regional food systems—that had developed over millennia on two continents.

Nationwide protests after the murder of George Floyd16 in May 2020 were the latest demonstration of Black resistance to the long arc of American racism exemplified by Jim Crow, lynching, redlining (Figures 3 and 4 on following page), vigilante violence, the Great Land Robbery17, mass incarceration, and more. Policies, laws, norms, and resources that deny opportunities to others have also been used to discriminate against Hispanic/Latinx, who are “always a step away from derision, detention and deportation,”18 and Asian Americans, who have to overcome “the marginalized image of Asian Americans as perpetual foreigners.”19
Between 1935 and 1940, the Home Owners’ Loan Corporation assigned grades to neighborhoods in cities across America. Areas that received the lowest grade, “D,” were colored red and deemed “hazardous.” For example, notes for East San Diego included “There is no concentration of any foreign element. However, many Mexicans scattered throughout the area.”

Redlining was a mechanism for making it difficult or impossible for anyone residing in redlined areas—the majority of whom were BIPOC families—to access financing to become homeowners. The consequences of redlining have echoed through the past 80 years and are visible in the wealth gap and other inequalities we see today, particularly in southeastern San Diego (but not limited to that area). Research establishes that children’s outcomes in adulthood vary substantially based on the neighborhood where they were raised: children born to low income parents in southeastern San Diego were likely to have lower household incomes in adulthood.

Earnings of Top 0.1% Grew 15 Times as Fast as 90% of Earners

Wealth and Power are Concentrated in the Hands of Few

Racism and White dominant culture, along with phobias and other forms of hatred, restrict opportunities for women, low-income individuals and families, LGBTQ+ people, the elderly, people with disabilities and existing health issues, immigrants and refugees, people who are or have been incarcerated, people without a high school education, and more.

Injustice, inequality, and discrimination are the rule, not the exception. In fact, people are marginalized, oppressed, and disadvantaged by the intersectionality of race, class, gender identity, sexual orientation, religion, and other identity markers, creating significant health disparities, wage and income disparities, continued exploitation of labor, and barriers to opportunity and ownership. The traumas inflicted on BIPOC communities have never been rectified, nationally nor here in San Diego County.

In recognition of the lasting impact of systemic racism, the Board of Supervisors of the County of San Diego declared that racism is a public health problem in January 2021. The declaration states that the County will amplify and address racism, support the creation of a County Racial Equity Action Plan, and will build on health equity efforts within departments.

Earnings of Top 0.1% Grew 15 Times as Fast as 90% of Earners

Economic wealth and power in the United States today is concentrated in the hands of a privileged few. While a small percentage of Americans who are wealthy mostly White males have secure net worths consisting of income from capital gains, interest, dividends, assets, and savings, the vast majority of Americans sustain an income from wages, social security, or retirement. Millions struggle on a daily basis to earn sufficient wages to provide for themselves and their families. Over the past 40 years, real wages for 90% of the working population have remained stagnant, while wages for those in the top 1% have steadily increased (Figure 5).

The latest data from the Federal Reserve Survey of Consumer Finances demonstrates that millions of Americans, especially Black and Hispanic/Latinx, lack the economic security that makes other freedoms meaningful — and they are denied the opportunity to improve their lives. The report confirms that White American families have higher net worths and emergency savings, were more likely to receive inheritances, own homes, and have access to employer-sponsored retirement plans, and were likely to complete four years or more of college and work from home than Black and Hispanic/Latinx families.
Market Concentration

Market concentration is also a structural feature of the global economy that contributes to an unjust food system and society. Research on the concentration of ownership, wealth, and power among food system businesses shows that “just a few companies dominate almost all aspects of food production.” For example, an analysis of the combined market share of the top four firms across sectors reveals that they control:

- 82% of the market for soft drinks in the United States (Coke, Pepsi, Dr. Pepper, and Talking Rain);
- 50% of the market for fresh cut salad (Chiquita, Dole, Taylor Farms, and Ready Pac);
- 73% of beef processing (JBS, Tyson, Cargill, and Marfrig);
- 77% of beer (AB InBev, Molson Coors, Constellation, and Heineken);
- 45% of retail grocery stores (Walmart, Kroger, Costco, Albertsons).

The “Big 10” food corporations—Nestle, Pepsico, Unilever, Mars, Coca-Cola, Danone, Mondelez International, Associated British Foods, General Mills, and Kellogg had sales over $401 billion in 2020, more than the gross domestic product of most countries. Market consolidation restricts opportunities for small and medium sized food system businesses to thrive (despite the fact that small and medium sized businesses make up a large percentage of all farms, fishing operations, food processors, food manufacturers, restaurants, and other food system businesses in America and San Diego County), limits consumer choices, limits transparency, and limits resilience to disturbances like climate change and COVID-19.

Racism, White dominant culture, sexism, and other forms of discrimination combine with wage stagnation and market concentration to limit opportunities for millions of Americans. For this reason, movements like Black Lives Matter have focused on economic justice, community control, political power, and reparations. More and more food system business owners, workers, and advocates, BIPOC or otherwise, see cultivating justice as fundamental to viable, healthy, strong, and fair food systems.
Empowering Workers to Lead the Change Toward a More Equitable Food System

WRITTEN BY DERRICK ROBINSON, PHD — SENIOR RESEARCHER AND POLICY ANALYST, CENTER FOR POLICY INITIATIVES

Our food system, as one system in a global economy, exploits labor globally, nationally, and locally. It is structured to be unjust toward workers. Corporations are incentivized to minimize inputs, like labor, in order to maximize profits.

The major challenges facing food workers, particularly Hispanic/Latinx communities in San Diego County, are low wages, lack of support for workers’ rights, and lack of career advancement opportunities. In 2019, food preparation and service occupations had the lowest median earnings ($18,822) of any occupation in San Diego County. Since most San Diego County food system workers are Hispanic/Latinx (47%), they are disproportionately impacted by food insecurity, nutrition insecurity, housing insecurity, and other challenges associated with low wages and incomes.

In the United States, food system workers face the highest amount of labor law violations, specifically associated with wage theft (i.e., receiving wages below minimum wage; not receiving overtime pay). Food system workers also lack union representation, and San Diego as a region lacks adequate labor law and regulatory enforcement. Without mechanisms for workers’ rights and labor law enforcement, employers are able to exploit workers when negotiating wages and benefits.

We must overcome these challenges and build on community assets by advancing policies that incentivize employee ownership and protect workers. Food system workers need equitable access to business ownership opportunities in the food system so they may benefit from the profits gained through their labor. We also need policies to protect workers and their families, including the following:

• Minimum wage policy that provides a livable wage (currently: $21.19)
• Wage theft policy that prevents employers from underpaying employees
• Fair work week policy that ensures food system workers have access to predictable schedules
• Local wage boards that set multiple minimum wages by sector and occupation

Moving toward restorative justice in the food system starts with empowering workers to lead the change toward a more equitable food system. The Center on Policy Initiatives (CPI), where I work, uses research, community organizing, and public education to seek policy changes that promote economic justice and prosperity for working families. We work to end poverty by building a fair economy in which good jobs with healthcare coverage allow all working people to live with dignity.

Personally, I am inspired to do this work because I believe that I am part of a collective. A collective of energy and intentions that are working to integratively move people out of the despair that current systems and structures have placed them in. I want justice and more equity for all, and a better earth for our people and all the organisms within it.

References:
28 US Census, American Community Survey, 2019, 1-year estimates
29 U.S. Department of Labor, Low Wage, High Violation Industries
30 Based on MIT Living Wage calculation, per adult, household size: 2 adults, 2 children.
Opportunities for Transformation

“My vision for a more just food system is one where food workers can afford to live in the neighborhoods where they serve, shop at the businesses they help keep in business, and be treated as the essential important parts of the local economy that they are.”

SAN DIEGO COUNTY RESIDENT
San Diego County Food Vision 2030 Surveys

Through Food Vision 2030, we have an opportunity to address rampant racial, class, and gender inequality in the food system.

To cultivate justice, we must reimagine a food system that belongs to all of us. We can pursue opportunities to expand healthy food access, ownership, and power across marginalized groups, especially Black, Indigenous, and people of color, to create a more just food system in San Diego County.

Food Vision 2030 Objectives and Strategies for Cultivating Justice in San Diego County

OBJECTIVE 1
Preserve Agricultural Land and Soils, and Invest in Long-Term Food Production
Objectives 1 uplifts strategies that preserve agricultural lands for future generations, increase support for the long-term business success of local producers, particularly BIPOC producers, and invest in long-term food production.

OBJECTIVE 2
Increase the Viability of Local Farms, Fisheries, Food Businesses, and Workers
Objectives 2 uplifts strategies that expand and link business services, technical assistance, and financing programs (particularly for BIPOC communities), promote community wealth building opportunities (like employee ownership) and farm viability models (like agritourism), and expands funding for climate change preparation, mitigation, and adaptation.

OBJECTIVE 3
Scale Up Local, Sustainable, and Equitable Food Value Chains
Objectives 3 uplifts strategies that link supply and demand so that food system businesses, including BIPOC-run businesses do not have to continually “reinvent the wheel” for sourcing products, while also developing additional infrastructure and financing options for processors, manufacturers, and other food businesses.
OBJECTIVE 4

Elevate Wages and Working Conditions, and Improve Career Opportunities

Objective 4 uplifts strategies that provide meaningful career opportunities for food system workers while advocating for better wages, access to health care, and other frequently cited needs.

OBJECTIVE 5

Expand Integrated Nutrition and Food Security

Objective 5 uplifts strategies that help families experiencing nutrition insecurity “navigate a minefield of bureaucratic hurdles” and food access programs achieve operational alignment to reach people where they are: whether at school, health care facilities, or food pantries.

OBJECTIVE 6

Improve Community Food Environments

Objective 6 uplifts strategies that improve access to healthy food throughout San Diego County’s communities, whether at retail markets, direct to consumer markets, community gardens, urban agriculture, community kitchens, or place-based educational centers.

OBJECTIVE 7

Scale Up Food Waste Prevention, Recovery, and Recycling Initiatives

Objective 7 uplifts strategies that reduce waste and ensure that good food ends up in bellies, including scaling up food recovery logistics and expanding food waste prevention technical assistance.

OBJECTIVE 8

Increase BIPOC Leadership Across the Food System

Objective 8 uplifts strategies that engage and defer to BIPOC communities in food system planning, elevate voices of BIPOC people, places, and programs, and invest in the next generation of leaders.

OBJECTIVE 9

Build a Movement that Uplifts a Local, Sustainable, and Equitable Food System

Objective 9 uplifts strategies that cover the need most frequently cited by interviewees, namely, more education around food system issues, including education around racial and ethnic disparities in our food system.

OBJECTIVE 10

Plan for a Resilient Food System

The unprecedented experience of the COVID-19 pandemic has also led to a renaissance in home bread baking and gardening, and the “Great Pivot” in food systems saw many producers increasing direct to consumer sales and more retailers offering take out and delivery services. This spirit of adaptability, coordination, and inclusivity was heartening to hear from interviewees and in survey responses. Objective 10 uplifts strategies that harness energy to “reset the table,” center BIPOC communities, and prevent another COVID-scale problem or the worst consequences of climate change from taking place.